TEORIA MUZYKI 17 (2020), ISSN 2299-8454

Mieczysław Tomaszewski

Sonorist Expressiveness and Allegorical Symbolism: Polish Symphony 1944-1994*

I. Symphony – a record of worldview

1. A celebrated genre. In 20th-century Poland, especially after World War Two, symphony became a significant and meaningful genre. Several noteworthy operas, cantatas and oratorios were composed during that time; the impact of Penderecki's *St Luke Passion* or *The Black Mask*, Lutosławski's *Trois Poèmes d'Henri Michaux* or Roman Palester's *Don Juan's Death* can hardly be overestimated. Some fame was won – quite deservedly – by symphonic pieces that were not always easy to classify in terms of genre: I refer here to Lutosławski's *Music of Mourning*, Panufnik's *Katyń Epitaph* and Penderecki's *Threnody*. In any case, it goes beyond any doubt that Lutosławski's *Third*, Palester's *Fifth*, Penderecki's *Second*, Góreckis *Symphony*

^{*} Mieczysław Tomaszewski, Sonorystyczna ekspresywność i alegoryczny symbolizm: symfonia "szkoły polskiej" [in:] M. Tomaszewski, Interpretacja integralna dzieła muzycznego. Rekonesans, Akademia Muzyczna w Krakowie, Kraków 2000.

of Sorrowful Songs are all works of particular significance. One may say that symphony has acquired the status of a representative genre.

The works united by this name often have very little in common. It is guite plausible to imagine pieces which do not carry that generic name but are readily considered as symphonies (including Bacewicz's Music for Strings, Trumpets, and Percussion or Serocki's Sinfonia sacra); other works called symphonies might not fulfil one's definition of the genre. But that is exactly the basic feature of this "set:" there are no two works identical in shape. Of course, apart from four-movement symphonies (such Z. Mycielski's and K. Meyer's Polish Symphonies), those with just three (Panufnik's Elegiaca and Baird's Ouasi una fantasia) or two (Górecki's Copernican or Lutosławski's Second) were composed as well; single movement symphonies were particularly frequent (Penderecki's Second). It should be added here that uniqueness and difference resulted from the movements' character and function rather than from their number. The four movements of Penderecki's First are Arché I, Dynamis I, Dynamis II and Arché II; the three in Górecki's are Laments; the two in Lutosławski's Second – an aleatoric fragment named Hésitant and a metered one, Direct.

Yet it should also be known that the archetype for the genre is still very visible in a variety of ways. What I have in mind are the antithetical and recapitulative form of the sonata allegro and the expressive differences between the individual parts of a symphonic cycle. And what comes to the fore, what brings the various forms and characters to a common denominator, is gravity and significance as the basic features of this genre of music.

2. "Born" and accidental symphonists. Few composers eschewed the symphony genre out of respect or indifference (which would hardly be surprising in the country of Chopin). The number of artists who tried their hand at it is surprisingly high. Symphonies were written by composers associated with various traditions: Austrian-German, French-Russian, and by those who were already fully brought up on the native tradition anchored in Szymanowski's symphonics and taught by Sikorski in Warsaw, Szabelski in Katowice, and Wiechowicz in Kraków.

The symphony genre has had a marked presence in the *oeuvre* of such composers as Bacewicz, Szabelski, Mycielski, Woytowicz, Turski, Malawski,

Serocki, Baird or Meyer, both in terms of the number and the import of their works. They represent a group of names often referred to – outside Poland – as "the Polish school;" its representatives may have been chiefly recognized on the concert stage as symphonists. Yet when one deals with the variety of the Polish symphonism which has become part of a universal European symphony, four names come to the fore: Lutosławski and Panufnik, Penderecki and Górecki.

The four symphonies by Lutosławski bring about four consecutive syntheses of his orchestra technique and poetics; they emphasize their allegiance to autonomous music. Heteronomous yet highly abstract thinking is at the origins of Panufnik's ten symphonies. Penderecki dared to reverse the course of history; starting with his *Second*, he has been generating – with much aplomb and success – a "retroverse" kind of symphonism. And then there is the *Einzelgänger* Górecki, whose *Third Symphony*, barely fitting the conventions of the genre and the style of contemporary music – has produced a resonance beyond anything in the history of what is referred to as artistic music.

3. Between aesthetics and ethics was where much of the history of Polish symphony played out in the recent half-century. Careful reading of musical scores allows the hypothesis that symphony usually served to synthesize creative experience; more often than not, experimental music sought its home elsewhere. Symphony was also where a composer felt obliged to state his or her place in the surrounding reality; to state – as honestly as possible – his or her worldview. This tended to happen more often in extreme situations.

The above can be heard in music and can be read in scores. But then there is also the author's intent expressed in words; at times, it is best taken with a grain of salt, but taken it must be. On composing his *Sinfonia votive* in 1982, Panufnik declared: "my conscious intention was to create a kind of desperate supplication for Poland's lasting freedom built out of the growing urgency of my ardent petition to the Black Madonna."¹

While Krzysztof Meyer rejected the programme commonly attributed to his *Polish Symphony*, he stated that "it was written in a given situation, i.e. in the first days of the martial law" and that "quoting those three significant songs

¹ Andrzej Panufnik, *Composing myself*, Methuen, London 1987.

(national anthems) has a symbolic character."² Lutosławski's *Third* is born from the same moment of Poland's history, the beginnings of "Solidarity." Questioned about the origins of the piece, the ever-discreet composer replied: "I have never written programme music, but I do not deny that external events may be reflected in music."³

In the above statement by the author of *Polish Symphony*, the relationship between the work and the consciousness of the composer is undeniable. He wrote as much himself: "Music (...) is not there to reflect the complexity and the conflicts of our time; musical thinking runs parallel to thinking about the world that surrounds us, and expresses – consciously or unconsciously – the worldview of the artist."⁴ Apparently, a work of music, treated as serious and meaningful utterance, may serve as a kind of litmus test.

II. Events in history and artists' reactions

Historical events between the end of the war and the beginnings of sovereignty did not run in a straight line; the suspended state that lasted for almost half a century would at times assume a paradoxical form. In the greatest of simplifications, four phases of the development of symphony may be identified.⁵

1. Phase one, between 1944 and 1950, brings a reaction to the war and the occupation. It is often a time of anger, of mourning one's loved ones, of bittersweet joy at the so-called "liberation," and of raising the country from the ashes.

Two expressive categories show up with any intensity. The first of these is heroic, present in intonations of freedom fighters' marches and songs, such as *Warszawianka* quoted by Woytowicz in his *Warsaw Symphony* (Example 1).

² Krzysztof Meyer, Symfonia "Polska" Meyera, "Przekrój", 1984, nr 2017.

³ Witold Lutosławski, interview by Andrzej Chłopecki in "Kontrapunkty," Polish Radio 2, 1 September 1981. Quoted [in:] Tadeusz Kaczyński, *Lutosławski: życie i muzyka*, Sutkowski Edition, Warszawa 1994, p. 212.

⁴ Krzysztof Meyer, interview by Irina Nikolska, April 1978. Quoted [in:] I. Nikolska, *Symfonie K. Meyera* [in:] *Krzysztof Meyer: do i od kompozytora*, ed. M. Jabłoński, Ars Nova, Poznań 1994, p. 111.

⁵ For this periodization, see: Mieczysław Tomaszewski, O muzyce panegirycznej. Myśli z pogranicza estetyki i etyki, "Vivo", 1992, No. 2.



Example 1. B. Woytowicz, Symphony No. 2 "Warsaw," IV. Finale: Vivo



Example 1. B. Woytowicz, Symphony No. 2 "Warsaw," IV. Finale: Vivo, cont.



Example 2. Z. Turski, Symphony No. 2 "Olympian," II. Lento sostenuto

The choice of score examples is not accidental and is supposed to illustrate a situation both tragic and almost comical. In 1949, at the infamous Convention in Łagów, the communist authorities decreed the emergence, and the necessity of a further development, of socialist realism. The Minister of Culture declared at the time that Woytowicz's *Second Symphony*, nicknamed "Warsaw," might serve as a positive instance for the mandatory trend, while Turski's *Second*, "Olympian," is a negative example due to its "weird harmony and the lack of a clear and expressive narration," a sure sign of unwelcome Western associations and a manifestation of "formalism."

The attributes of "formalist" music were listed as "atonality, lack of programme, unmelodiousness, pessimism, lack of expression, novel artistic means resulting from intellectual speculation."⁶

2. Phase two, between 1950 and 1956, or the years of the Iron Curtain and of the terror against adversaries of the regime imposed upon the country. These were the "dual" years. On the one hand, this was a time when attempts were constantly made to impose the tenets of socialist realism; on the other, a time of protest, evasion and escape.

Two symphonies betray signs of conformist evasion: Panufnik's *Peace Symphony* (1951) and Skrowaczewski's *Victory Symphony* (1954). Seemingly written in "good faith," they both use of slogans to obscure the truth.

Escape from reality was a more frequent reaction. It came in two manifestations: within and backwards, i.e. towards folklore and towards older styles. At first, both were allowed and supported. The folklore of the Podhale served as the material for Mycielski's *Polish Symphony* and Kiesewetter's *Mountaineer Symphony*, that of the Kurpie – of Szabelski's

⁶ C.f. notes from the Łagów Convention, published in "Ruch Muzyczny", 1949, No. 14, especially statements by Minister Włodzimierz Sokorski and by Zofia Lissa. A number of source texts on socialist realism, written by co-authors of its programme, are also of interest: W. Sokorski, *Sztuka w walce o socjalizm*, Państwowy Instytut Wydawniczy, Warszawa 1950; Z. Lissa, *Muzykologia polska na przełomie*, Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, Kraków 1952; S. Łobaczewska, *Próby zbadania realizmu socjalistycznego w muzyce na podstawie polskiej twórczości 10-lecia*, "Studia muzykologiczne", 1956, No. 5; J.M. Chomiński and Z. Lissa, *Kultura muzyczna Polski Ludowej 1944-1955*, Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, Kraków 1957; J.M. Chomiński, *Muzyka Polski Ludowej*, Państwowe Wydawnictwo Naukowe, Warszawa 1968.

Third and Serocki's *Song Symphony*, one of the eminent pieces of the time (Example 3).



Example 3. K. Serocki, Symphony No. 2 "Symphony of Song," II. Scherzo (Wesele jedzie)



Example 3. K. Serocki, Symphony No. 2 "Symphony of Song," II. Scherzo (Wesele jedzie), cont.

The folklore of Poland's North had found its use in Jabłoński's *Cassubian Symphony* and Panufnik's *Sinfonia rustica* (Example 4):



Example 4. A. Panufnik, Symphony No. 2 "Sinfonia rustica," II. Con tenerezza



Example 4. A. Panufnik, Symphony No. 2 "Sinfonia rustica," II. Con tenerezza, cont.

Sikorski, Szabelski and Bacewicz wrote symphonies that related to the poetics of the baroque, classicism and romanticism. Soon, however, their final chorales were denounced as manifestations of "fideism," and folklore themes as "refusal to build socialism."

A dramatic expression of protest and rebellion came with Artur Malawski's *Second Symphony*, who condemned himself to "inner emigration." True emigration became the choice of Palester and Panufnik.

3. Phase three, between 1956 and 1974, or the so-called "post-October" years. This was the time of slight cracks in the Iron Curtain, the time of "thaw" followed by "frost," all in all a generally pseudoliberal period. The artists succeeded in making up for the lost time by acquainting themselves with the latest developments of music in the West. A key role was played by contemporary music festivals, first and foremost the "Warsaw Autumn;" festivals in Poznań and Wrocław soon followed suit.

The interest in serialism and aleatorism bordered on euphoria. Folklorism and neostyles were discarded overnight. The doors were thrown open to European universality. In terms of texture and form, symphony of the time becomes chamber-like, and it is sonorist in terms of musical matter. Mycielski and Baird both write their *Sinfoniae brevis*, Schäffer and Serocki – their *Small Symphonies* and *Sinfoniettas*, Spisak and Panufnik – their *Symphonies concertante*. Sonorism becomes a specialty of the "Polish school." Górecki introduces a serial version of sonorism in his *Symphony No. 1 "1959"* (Example 5).



Example 5. H.M. Górecki, Symphony No. 1 "1959," II. Antyphone



Example 5. H.M. Górecki, Symphony No. 1 "1959," II. Antyphone, cont.

A l e a t o r i c (partially controlled) sonorism fills much of Penderecki's *First* and Lutosławski's *Second*. It becomes a powerful means of expression.

And just when the regime might have thought that the composers are engrossed with their experiments with sound and no longer care about what is going on in their country, there comes:

4. Phase four, which started in 1974 and continues until today.

From a historical point of view, this is a period first predetermined by the consequences of the Gdańsk massacre, and then by veiled terror on one side, and veiled resistance and rebellion – which eventually resulted in "Solidarity" and sovereignty – on the other.

The history of symphony of the time saw a very strong trend among the composers to define their own identities through music: to take sides. Initiated by Penderecki in his large-scale vocal-instrumental works, the return towards lost and abandoned values – religious and moral, patriotic and humanist – manifests itself in symphonic scores. This is when Górecki composes his *Symphony of Sorrowful Songs* (Example 6).



Example 6. H.M. Górecki, Symphony No. 3 "Sorrowful Songs," I. Synku miły...



Example 6. H.M. Górecki, Symphony No. 3 "Sorrowful Songs," I. Synku miły..., cont.

A little earlier, he had composed his *Symphony No. 2 "Copernican,"* also filled with a religious message. Penderecki declared in 1987: "To restore the sacred dimension to reality is the sole way of saving man. Art should be a source of difficult hope."⁷ The 1980s witnessed the appearance of Penderecki's *Christmas Eve Symphony*, Panufnik's *Votive* and then

⁷ Krzysztof Penderecki, *Kulturotwórcza moc chrześcijaństwa*, "Tygodnik Powszechny", 1988, No. 1.

Sinfonia di Speranza, Meyer's *Polish* or Lutosławski's *Third* (Example 7), described by a monographer as possessed of "a remarkable power and the ability to uplift the spirit."



Example 7. W. Lutosławski, Symphony No. 3, Allegro/tutta forza (final part)



Example 7. W. Lutosławski, Symphony No. 3, Allegro/tutta forza (final part), cont.

III. Evolution and varieties of the genre, its functions and characters

To make things simple, three major varieties of Polish symphonism may be identified:

1. Thematic symphonism brings about a direct continuation of the type of symphony shaped by the post-romantic and modernist traditions. Its main means of expression include well-defined thematics and lucid form in a distant echo of the tonal era. The themes themselves may be "neutral," but they may also carry a semantic payload; if they do, it is usually allegorical. Thus, Woytowicz quoted a song of freedom fighters (*Warszawianka*), Panufnik – a religious hymn (*Bogurodzica*), Meyer – a patriotic anthem (*Nie rzucim ziemi*) (Example 8).

It may be said that this variety of symphony fulfilled, in Jakobsonian terms, conative and metalingual functions; its character was narrative and moralistic. Its message (*Botschaft*) rendered ideas and precepts, decoded through signs of a partially conventional "lexicon" of national culture.

2. Sonorist symphonism was a manifestation of a different trend, above all of a ludic tendency. As *musica libera*, it was a reaction to *musica adhaerens*.⁸ Thematics and form were replaced by sound and structure. Sound could consist in pure expression, although it could just as well be iconic in nature. Structure was determined by serial and aleatoric procedures. The music of sonorist symphonies was autotelic in its substance; Jakobson would classify its function as poetic, which is tantamount with a focus on the work *per se*. The message of Lutosławski's *Second*, Górecki's *First* or Penderecki's *First* (Example 9) consisted in *objets sonores*, sound objects and images, appealing to the sense of hearing, of imagination and connotation.

3. Synthetic symphonism. It emerged in the 1970s as a combination of traditional thematism and avant-garde sonorism, the two contrasting tendencies joined together through impact or association. It was, one could say, symphonic thematism refreshed by immersion in sonorism. The ludic features were replaced by reflexive emotionalism, pure aesthetics by philosophical and often metaphysical reflection. The idiom of metre and

⁸ These terms have been recalled in essays by Stefan Jarociński, *Ideologie romantyczne*, Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, Kraków 1979.

rhythm became archetypal or personal; an expression of a given human personality or condition. The logic of musical syntactics was back, increasingly construed out of *new tonality* or *new simplicity* (Example 10).



Example 8. K. Meyer, Symphony No. 6 "Polish," IV. Finale

STUDIA • INTERPRETACJE



Example 9. K. Penderecki, Symphony No. 1, I. Arché I

32



Example 10. H.M. Górecki, Symphony No. 3 "Sorrowful Songs," III. Kajze mi sie podzioł...

A piece of music becomes a carrier of personal feeling and symbolic senses decoded with hermeneutic methods. Its function is now both phatic and expressive. A certain postmodern influence may be visible in the composers' tendency to use "music within music." Palester's last symphony, his *Fifth*, suddenly resounds with Brahms and Schubert, both as manifestation of the death topos (Example 11).



Example 11. R. Palester, Symphony No. 5, V. Molto lento



Example 11. R. Palester, Symphony No. 5, V. Molto lento, cont.

In Penderecki's *Second* – nicknamed *Weihnachtssinfonie* – his allusive quotation of a Christmas carol triggers reflections that bring to mind "the idyllic and angelic innocence of youth" (Example 12).



Example 12. K. Penderecki, Symphony No. 2 "Christmas Eve," Quasi da lontano

4. Two fundamental yet complementary tendencies shaped the symphony genre in Polish music of the last half-century: that of sonorism and that of symbolism.

S o n o r i s m was particularly noticeable at times of relative freedom, as an expression of music freed from all non-artistic duties, given to pure play, of music that carried universal features. At times of danger and tension, ludic s o n o r i s m changed into e x p r e s s i v e sonorism. This sonorist expressiveness manifested itself in an explosive, elemental, dramatic and powerful character. Lutosławski saw this "elemental character" – in his opinion, "the opposite of intellectualism" (1976) – as a major feature of Polish music.

The s y m b o l i s m of symphonic utterance manifested itself very clearly in extreme situations. It served a composer to define his or her position on the fates of the nation and the country. It came under two different guises, allegorical and metaphorical. A l l e g o r i c a l symbolism used common conventional signs of the language of national culture. It was addressed to a broad social sphere. M e t a p h o r i c a l symbolism, less frequent, appealed to individual or archetypical feelings (inherent in the human condition). It required of its audience elitist hermeneutic skills.

The question arises whether these theses on symbolism have not been overstated. This calls for complementing listening to music with listening to composer's own statements:

Penderecki: "I have nothing against my music being treated as a «confession»" (1966).⁹

Panufnik: "I decided that *Sinfonia di speranza* should contain an optimistic message, an expression of hope and faith in humanity, and a tribute to the Beethovenian ideal of brotherhood" (1987).¹⁰

Lutosławski: "The creative artist's chief obligation is not to live a lie. To speak the truth, artistic truth, obviously" (1971).¹¹

⁹ K. Penderecki, interview by R. Wasiuta, Awangarda i tradycja, "Polska", 1966, No. 7.

¹⁰ A. Panufnik, op. cit.

¹¹ W. Lutosławski, interview by J. Cegiełła [in:] *Szkice do autoportretu polskiej muzyki współczesnej*, ed. J. Cegiełła, Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, Kraków 1976, p. 17. C.f. also T. Kaczyński, op. cit., p. 180.